



Report of the Committee

on

Education Sector Reforms in Pakistan

**Implementation of Article 25-A of the Constitution of the
Islamic Republic of Pakistan**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Executive Summary	i-v
S.No.	Description	Page No.
	Chapter-1 Introduction	
1	Background	1
1.1	Membership of the Committee	1
1.2	Mandate of the Committee	1
1.3	Terms of Reference of the Committee	2
1.4	Formation of Sub-Committees and Working Groups	2
1.5	Implementation Strategy	3
	Chapter-2 Education Sector of Pakistan	
2	Importance of Education	4
2.1	Constitutional Provisions	4
2.2	18 th Constitutional Amendment	5
2.3	Pakistan's International Commitments	5-7
2.4	Pakistan and Human Development Index	7-8
2.5	Significance of Early Childhood Education	8-9
2.5.1	Early Childhood Education in Pakistan	9
2.6	National Education Policies	9
2.6.1	Salient Features of the Education Policy (1979)	10
2.6.2	Salient Features of the Education Policy (1992)	10
2.6.3	Salient Features of the National Education Policy (1998)	10
2.6.4	Salient Features of the National Education Policy (2009)	11
2.6.5	Salient Features of Draft National Education Policy (2017)	12-13
2.7	Focus of all the Policies	13
	Chapter-3 Situational Analysis of Primary Education in Pakistan	
3	Endeavors of Provincial Governments after Devolution of Education	14
3.1	Primary Education National Scenario	14-15
3.2	Primary Education Provincial Scenario	15-16
3.3	Provincial Annual Development Plans FY 2017	16
3.4	Data Analysis and Assessment	16-17
3.4.1	Assessment	17
	Chapter-4 Gap Analysis	
4	Data Analysis	18
4.1	Infrastructure (Existing and Required Schools)	18

4.2	Teachers (Existing and Required)	18
4.3	Budget (Existing and Required)	18
4.4	Quality Education	19
4.5	Assessment	19
4.6	A National Plan is Required	19
	Chapter-5	
5	Key Lessons Learnt/Conclusion	20
	Chapter-6 Recommendations	
6	Recommendations	21-24
	ANNEXURES	
	Approved Templates	Annex-A
	Data from Punjab	Annex-B
	Data from Sindh	Annex-C
	Data from KPK	Annex-D
	Data from Balochistan	Annex-E
	Data from FATA	Annex-F
	Data from Gilgit-Baltistan	Annex-G
	Data from ICT	Annex-H
	Minutes of meeting dated 3-5-2018	Annex-I
	Minutes of meeting dated 11-5-2018	Annex-J
	Minutes of meeting dated 18-5-2018	Annex-K
	Minutes of meeting dated 12-6-2018	Annex-L
	Minutes of meeting dated 28-6-2018	Annex-M
	Minutes of meeting dated 25-9-2018	Annex-N
	Recommendations made by the Law & Justice Commission	Annex-O

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Education has a key role in the development of a nation. The progress of a country or a nation depends on quality education. Education, is, therefore, considered as a pre-requisite for combating poverty, raising productivity, improving living conditions, and making enlightened citizens. Education has always been the major concern of successive governments in Pakistan since its inception. But no successful headway has been made in the field of education as half-hearted attempts have been made in the past and the situation has assumed an alarming proportion.

It is in this background that the Honourable Chief Justice of Pakistan constituted a Committee under the chairmanship of the Honourable Federal Ombudsman with the mandate to implement the provision of Article 25-A of the Constitution of Pakistan under which the state is obligated to provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of 5 to 16 years in such a manner as determined by law.

The Committee held a number of meetings and also constituted three sub-committees to develop a template identifying major issues in the education system which input from Provincial governments; to examine challenges relating to uniformity of education in all parts of the country and to propose revision and roadmap for short, medium and long term goals and targets.

The Committee noted that under the 18th Constitutional Amendment, Education has been devolved to the Provinces. Coordination role by the Federal Government, therefore, also came under discussion. The Provincial Government have developed roadmaps to deliver the commitment articulated in Article 25-A of the Constitution and prepared School Education Sector Plans which provide a vision and instruments to implement the legal obligation of Article 25-A for free and compulsory education to all children and have laid down the foundation for improvement in education sector. These plans very articulately highlight challenges, opportunities and clear targets to achieve with focus on activities that will expand access to good quality education in a sustainable manner. However, despite efforts desired results have not been achieved

all the issues are still persisting. The data received from the federating units and ICT has been analyzed and the gaps of infrastructure, teachers, budget and quality education have been identified.

The existing Primary Education scenario presents a dismal picture. As per latest population census, the total number of children in age group 5 to 16 has risen to 68.4 million out of which 39.36 million are out of school. The major challenge is to enroll this large number of out of school children in age group 5 to 16. Related to this, there are challenges of availability of quality of teachers, school and basic facilities, quality curriculum and text books. Teachers are the most important element in the whole education system.

Quality education can only be achieved through quality teachers. Basic facilities like school buildings, electricity, laboratories and drinking water are necessities for education. Curricula of school education do not fulfill the requirements of technological era. Teachers learn this curriculum only for degree, only for knowledge. School curricula do not prepare the students for the market. Better quality text books at affordable prices are necessary for promoting Pakistan in knowledge based society.

Situation which emerges from the gap analysis is alarming as Pakistan is faced with the challenge of 39 million out of school children in the age group of 5 to 16 years and around 2 million children are estimated to be added every year. In order to meet the above challenges short term and long term measures are required.

As regards short term measures there is an urgent need to declare an education emergency. New formal schools are required to be constructed to meet the existing gap and future needs. Requirement and training of large number of teachers is required. Teachers need to be trained and equipped with latest teaching techniques on regular basis. It needs to be ensured that teachers go and work in remote areas for teaching duty. Incentive to teachers be provided in the shape of promotions related to their performance. Basic facilities missing in the existing schools may be provided on a fast

track so that all schools and buildings are fully functional. Incentives need to be provided to poor parents to send their children to school as one of the primary reasons for large number of students being out of school is that poor parents cannot afford to send their children to school and pay school fee and bear expenses to school books and uniform. The incentive programme may include waiver of school fee, provision of free text books and payment of stipends for poor students.

All above measures require substantial increase in expenditure on education. Budget provision needs to be enhanced from present 2.2% of GDP to 4% of GDP. It would need to be ensured that funds are properly utilized and are not lapsed or allocated to other sectors. An annual increase of 25% in the existing budget of provinces/areas would be required to reach the targets.

As formal school system is not in a position to cope with the growing demand alone, non formal ways of education should also be adopted such as non formal schools, community schools and public private partnership. It is also critical that double shifts are introduced in all schools where sufficient numbers of students are available to ensure enrolment and education for each and every child. Its implementation would also require additional recruitment of teachers and staff with budget.

NCHD's work for promoting literacy has been noteworthy in the past. A merit based management with enhanced funding – 50 % - annually is recommended to expand the network to meet the requirement.

Among the long term measures, quality education is very important. A well thought out practical and doable intervention framework needs to be worked out to ensure quality education in the long run. The quality and standardization of curriculum are important challenges which require our attention and Federal Government and the concerned Ministry along with provincial representatives should undertake immediate review and up-gradation measures in this regard.

Road map should be developed for private sector schools for affordable service delivery. Since the numbers are so large, and the private sector is already involved on a major scale, the role of regulatory bodies needs to be made more effective by appointing persons of integrity and merit. Hundreds of thousands of parents and students are affected by the mal-practices of private schools and superior courts are approached because the regulatory bodies are unable to enforce and protect the interest of students and parents.

Education is part of service industry and manufacturing sector. Industry based non formal education should be introduced in schools with the help of private sector. These forward and backward linkages in the labor market will ensure decent jobs, good remuneration and employment to educate youth. Government in consultation with the representatives of Deeni Madaris should devise a programme for imparting formal education.

While there is no dearth of excellent plans and proposals in the various national education policies since 1947 and provincial/area development plans, implementation is the weakest area. There is, therefore, a need for elaborate oversight and monitoring mechanism as follows:-

- i. At the district level the committee should be headed by the Deputy Commissioner of the area with heads of education department, regulatory agency, civil society and private sector as members.
- ii. The Committee at the provincial level should be headed by the Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.) with representatives of education and finance departments, planning and development department along with private sector schools and head of Provincial Regulatory body, as members.

- iii. The government should in the long run take steps to constitute monitoring committees at Union Council level, having representation of parents, civil society and school administration to act as watch dog.
- iv. School Management Committees may be revitalized and civil society members be involved apart from school administration & parents.

The above Committees should hold regular meetings and surprise visits of the sites. Implementation, performance and utilization of allocated budget should be monitored for transparency, efficacy and outcome against agreed and uniform Key Performance Indicators (KPIs).

Last but not the least, a paradigm shift is required to accord appropriate priority to education sector in terms of financial and human resources with sufficiently empowered institutions of oversight for effective enforcement of Article 25-A of the Constitution. There should be a realization in the society that education is a fundamental right and government is making all out effort to make education accessible and meaningful for all, and society as a whole should contribute.

Chapter-1

INTRODUCTION

1. Background

The Honourable Chief Justice, Supreme Court of Pakistan called a meeting of the Committee on Education Reforms constituted in criminal original petition No. 133 of 2016 titled Malik Muhammad Khan Awan vs. Capt. (Retd) Zahid Saeed on 16-04-2018. After detailed discussions and deliberations, a Committee was constituted under the chairmanship of the Hon'ble Federal Ombudsman for cause of education in the country.

1.1. Membership of the Committee

Following is the composition of the Committee

- **Syed Tahir Shahbaz, Hon'able Wafaqi Mohtasib.....Chair**
- Mr. U.A.G. Isani, Former Chairman University Grants Commission
- Mr. Abdul Rauf Chaudhry, Former Federal Tax Ombudsman
- Dr. Muhammad Raheem Awan, Secretary Law & Justice Commission
- Dr. Shahid Siddiqui, Vice Chancellor Allama Iqbal Open University
- Dr. Mukhtar Ahmed, Former Chairman Higher Education Commission
- Mr. Muhammad Rafique Tahir, Joint Educational Advisor Ministry of Education
- Dr. Mahmood-ul-Hasan Butt, Former Consultant Higher Education Commission
- Secretary Capital Administration & Development Division
- Secretary Ministry of Federal Education & Professional Training
- Secretary School Education Govt. of Punjab
- Secretary Education, Govt. of Sindh
- Secretary Primary Education KPK
- Secretary Education Govt. of Balochistan
- Secretary Education AJK
- Secretary Education Govt. of Gilgit-Baltistan
- Secretary Social Sector Department FATA

1.2. Mandate of the Committee

Under the leadership of the Hon'ble Federal Ombudsman, the Committee has the following mandate;

- to Implement provisions of the Article 25-A of the Constitution of Pakistan

- development of national consensus document for achieving uniformity in education standards and policy for the entire country
- promote national cohesion through quality education and training.

1.3. Terms of Reference of the Committee

The Committee with consensus developed the following Terms of Reference

- conduct a situational and gaps analysis with reference to infrastructure facilities, quality education, human resources and budgetary allocation in the context of the implementation of Article 25-A in the provincial and area education departments.
- explicitly define the role of all the stakeholders to ensure the effective implementation of Article 25-A which includes the public, private, non-formal sectors, development partners and Madrassas etc.
- propose revision and roadmap for provincial and area education sector plans, based on the outcomes of gaps analysis, ensuring the elaboration of short, medium and long-term goals and targets with a focus on improving access, equity, quality and governance with defined budgetary allocations
- propose an action plan for addressing quality, curriculum, textbooks, teaching, assessment and access to education
- design an interprovincial coordination and monitoring mechanism with a periodic reporting system to follow up and monitor the implementation of the plans and to resolve issues through timely action on the forum of Inter Provincial Education Ministers' Conference (IPEMC).

1.4. Formation of Sub-Committees and Working Groups

The sub-committees and working groups were formed to work on different aspects of the task. The Reports of the sub-committees were presented to the main Committee in its meetings for consideration and formulation of a consensus and comprehensive implementation plan.

Following three sub-committees were formed;

- Sub-Committee-1: to develop a template identifying the major issues in the education system and to get input and consensus on this from Provincial Governments
- Sub-Committee-2: to examine the issues relating to uniformity of education in all parts of the country and to propose changes to improve access, equity, quality and governance in the system
- Sub-Committee-3: to propose revision and roadmap for short, medium and long term goals and targets

1.5. Implementation Strategy

The Implementation Plan would be submitted to the Hon'able Chief Justice of Pakistan for endorsement, and thereafter would be sent to the government for implementation

Chapter-2

EDUCATION SECTOR OF PAKISTAN

2. Importance of Education

Education is the only source of human capital formation and producing responsible citizens in the country. Therefore, education has always been the major concern of successive governments in Pakistan since its inception. The progress of a country or a nation depends on poverty reduction, raising productivity, improving living conditions, protecting the environment and making enlightened citizens. Further, poverty alleviation and integrated human development, universalizing access and quality education, women empowerment and elimination of all forms of discrimination, community mobilization and strengthening partnership of Public and Private Sector are the priority goals and commitments of the present government. The Vision 2025 provides a balanced educational approach, politically united, economically sound and prosperous, morally and spiritually elevated nation's programs to meet the 21st century challenges.

Education is essential for a developed and progressive society as it empowers and creates ability among the individuals and the societies to utilize their productive capabilities. It boosts socio-economic development, reduces poverty and inequalities in the society thus contributes to democracy, harmony, tolerance, peace and stability. Education is not just about getting a degree and passing in exams. Education offers knowledge to people. It lets them open their minds to new things and helps them perceive things in new ways to realize their full potential. Education is a powerful weapon to combat prejudices, terrorism, diseases & mortality rates and to promote gender equality. Education can do so many things to improve lives, and it is one of the most important investments a country can make for its people and its future.

Pakistan as a developing country with 6th largest population in the world with 60% of youth critically requires a widely accessible quality and equitable education system. Investment in education is investing in the future of the country and to achieving all other human rights.

2.1. Constitutional Provisions

The Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan guarantees provision of education to its citizens;

Article 25-A¹

- The State shall provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of five to sixteen years in such manner as may be determined by law

¹ Article 25-A was introduced in 2010

Article 37-B

- The State shall remove illiteracy and provide free and compulsory secondary education within minimum possible period

Article 38-B

- The State shall provide basic necessities of life, such as food, clothing, housing, education and medical relief, for all such citizens, irrespective of sex, caste, creed or race, as are permanently or temporarily unable to earn their livelihood on account of infirmity, sickness or unemployment

2.2. 18th Constitutional Amendment

Under the 18th Constitutional Amendment, Education has been devolved to the provinces which are responsible for the award of education up to intermediate level. The Academy of Educational Planning and Management (AEPAM), after the devolution of the Ministry of Education under 18th Constitutional Amendment, is being administratively controlled by Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training and performing the functions of collation of education data collected through Provincial/Regional EMISs (Education Management Information System) and maintains linkages with Provincial and District Organization and Education Institutions.

2.3. Pakistan's International Commitments

Pakistan is a signatory of important international initiatives regarding education;

- **The Universal Declaration of Human Rights**

The Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) is a historic document that was adopted by the United Nations General Assembly at its third session on 10 December 1948 as the "common standard of achievement for all peoples and nations". The Declaration for the first time in human history spelled out basic civil, political, economic, social and cultural rights that all human beings should enjoy. The Article 26 of UDHR provides as under;

- *Everyone has the right to education. Education shall be free, at least in the elementary and fundamental stages. Elementary education shall be compulsory. Technical and professional education shall be made generally available and higher education shall be equally accessible to all on the basis of merit.*

▪ Education for All (EFA)

At the World Conference on Education for All (Jomtien, Thailand 1990) delegates from 155 governments including Pakistan, met to discuss major aspects of Education for All (EFA). Ten years after Jomtien, the World Education Forum was again convened where 182 countries including Pakistan participated. It concluded with the adoption of the Dakar Framework for Action (April 2000) which outlined the following goals:

- i) Expanding and improving comprehensive early childhood care and education, especially for the most vulnerable disadvantaged children;*
- ii. Ensuring that by 2015 all children, with special emphasis on girls and children in difficult circumstances have access to complete, free and compulsory primary education of good quality;*
- iii. Ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning, life skills and citizenship programs;*
- iv. Achieve a 50% improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015, especially for women and equitable access to basic and continuing education for all adults;*
- v. Eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005, and achieving gender equality in education by 2015, with a focus on ensuring girls' full and equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality; and*
- vi. Improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence of all so that recognized and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills.*

▪ Millennium Development Goals 2015

The Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) were the eight international development goals for the year 2015 that were established in the Millennium Summit of the United Nations in 2000, following the adoption of the United Nations Millennium Declaration. Goals 2 & 3 specifically address education:

Goal 2: Achieve Universal Primary Education

Target 3: Ensure that by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling.

Goal 3: Promote Gender equality and Empower Women

Target 4: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education by 2005 and at all levels of education, no later than 2015

Pakistan's performance was not very up-to-mark on Goal-2.

▪ **Sustainable Development Goals**

The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) are a collection of 17 global goals set by the United Nations. The broad goals are interrelated though each has its own targets to achieve. The SDGs are also known as "Transforming our World: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development". SDGs were developed to replace the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) which ended in 2015. Unlike the MDGs, the SDG framework does not distinguish between "developed" and "developing" nations. Instead, the goals apply to all countries.

Goal-4 relates to Quality Education and to ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all.

Frame work of SDGs encourages the signatory countries to develop local framework to achieve international commitment according to the requirements and resources. Pakistan as a signatory of SDGs has developed a National Framework for localization of SDGs at district level to improve public social service delivery for implementation of the global agenda. To accomplish SDGs, the federal government has decided to enhance working relationship with the provinces by providing all possible support to ensure successful implementation of all SDGs including those related to education.

2.4. Pakistan and Human Development Index

The UNDP Human Development Report 2014 ranked Pakistan at 148th out of 187 countries on Human Development Index². In 2017 Report, Pakistan's HDI ranking is 147.th

According to a National Human Development Report (NHDR) launched by UNDP in 2018, Pakistan currently has the largest population of young people ever recorded in its history. It is one of the youngest countries in the world and the second youngest in the South Asian region after Afghanistan, having total 64 percent of total below the age of 30, and 29 percent between the ages of 15-29 years. According to the Report, only 14 out of 195 countries spend less on education than Pakistan while nine of these have a lower HDI ranking than Pakistan.

Report highlights that to achieve the goal-4 of SDGs by 2030 Pakistan must increase its net ratio to a yearly growth of 3.8 percent. It is suggested that Pakistan needs to create

² HDI measures health, education and standard of living of a country.

new jobs over the next five years and enroll millions of its out of school children in coming years to properly utilize 64 percent of the youth bulge that provides a unique opportunity for its economy to grow faster and sustainably.

2.5. Significance of Early Childhood Education

The process of development of personality and nurturing the potential of children commences from the very beginning of their lives. Experts have found out that physical and mental capabilities of children grow more rapidly up to the age of 8 years, and period between 2 to 5 years is highly critical in this respect. The early years are critical and formative for the acquisition of the concepts, and development of skills and attitudes that lay the foundations for lifelong learning. This period is characterized by rapid physical, intellectual, emotional, social and moral development. Provision of quality early childhood care and education makes a positive difference in their future learning, career, and adult life as good citizens.

Children's early experiences – the bonds they form with their parents and their first learning experiences – deeply affect their future physical, cognitive, emotional and social development. Optimizing the early years of children's lives is the best investment in ensuring their future success. Investment in early childhood is a powerful economic strategy, with returns over the life course many times the size of the original expenditure. A child's dreams can come true with the right education and that it is the joint responsibility of parents and the society to help children realize their dreams.

Investment on Early Childhood Education (ECE) brings following benefits to the individual, education system and the society as a whole.

- **Benefits to children**
 - Improvement in cognitive (thinking, reasoning) skills or 'Learning to Know'
 - Development of their skills to communicate, question, create and solve new problems
 - Reinforcement of their social development (how to nurture and maintain good relations with adults, their other fellows) or 'Learning to Live Together'
 - Set the foundation for enhancement of learning outcomes in next grades which help them achieve success in their career
- **Benefits for Education System and Society**
 - Improved attendance and retention rates of the children who have received ECCE prior to enrolment in formal Grade I of the primary school
 - Drop-out rate is reduced and thus wastage of resources is minimized

- Graduates of the education system become productive and contributing members of the society and law abiding citizens; with reduction in the crime rate and positive contribution to the economic growth
- Cost-saving in health care recipients of ECE are better prepared to adopt healthy life style and practices

2.5.1. Early Childhood Education in Pakistan

In public sector school of Pakistan, a proper and well planned Early Childhood Education (ECE) has been non-existent. Historically, there are no standardized facilities for the provision of proper early childhood education to them. Neither a separate class room, nor full time services of an exclusive teacher are provided to these children.

Recently, ECE Centers are being established in Punjab, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, and Sindh. ECE is also part of Education Sector Plans prepared by provincial Education Departments. According to Pakistan Statistics 2015-16, total enrolment of pre-primary education was 8.74 million, and Gross Enrolment Ratio was 74%. Majority of these enrolled children are above 5 years of age. Out of these, 4.21 million or 48.17 % are in private sector and 51.83 % in public sector educational institutions. In private sector there are 448 institutions exclusively offering pre-primary education with a total 2,785 teachers.

2.6. National Education Policies

Since independence in 1947, a variety of documents were developed on National Education Policies as guidelines on access, quality and governance in education sector of Pakistan;

- National Education Conference (1947)
- Report of the Commission on National Education (1959)
- The Education Policy (1972)
- National Education Policy (1979)
- National Education Policy (1992)
- National Education Policy (1998)
- National Education Policy (2009)
- Draft National Education Policy (2017)

2.6.1. Salient Features of the Education Policy (1979)

The primary objective of this policy was to "Islamise" education in Pakistan, and to develop a curriculum more suited to national aspirations and a minimum level of literacy was to be ensured. The elitist, two-tiered system of education was to be eradicated by directing government sponsored English medium schools to adopt Urdu as a medium of education. Thus, the unfair advantage the students of English medium schools had in the job market to be eliminated.

Another significant decision in the policy was the recognition of Madrassa, or Mosque school, as an educational institution per se.

2.6.2. Salient Features of the Education Policy (1992)

The Education Policy 1992 was focused on the following;

- Achieving universal primary education, eliminating drop-out rates, and fulfilling the basic learning needs by the year 2002.
- Encouraging involvement of the private sector for participation in the education system.
- Stressing women's education.
- Raising the quality of an extensive in-service teachers' training program
- Diversification of vocational streams along with expansion of graduate and postgraduate level courses.
- Reforming of examination system.
- Introducing computer education at school level
- Encouraging community participation in educational affairs

2.6.3. Salient Features of the National Education Policy (1998)

The main features of the Education Policy (1998-2010) are as under;

- Every child of six to twelve year age group will be in a school within five years
- katchi class at primary level shall be introduced as part of the effort to improve the achievement of pupils
- Access to elementary education shall be increased, through effective and optimum utilization of existing facilities and services, as well as provision of new facilities and services
- Improving the quality, access and efficiency of elementary education
- Strengthening, governance, management/planning, supervision, monitoring & evaluation
- Ensuring financial sustainability of elementary education and also to build institutional capacity

2.6.4. Salient Features of the National Education Policy (2009)

The policy document identifies policy actions in pursuit of two overarching objectives:

- Widening access to education; and
- Improving quality

It also speaks about the two important gaps:

- Commitment and
- Implementation.

Key Policy Actions identified are as follows:

- Provinces and Area Governments shall affirm the goal of achieving universal and free primary education by 2015 and up to class 10 by 2025.
- Provincial and Area Governments shall develop plans for achieving these targets, including intermediate enrolment targets and estimates of the required financial, technical, human and organizational resources.
- The plans shall also promote equity in education with the aim of eliminating social exclusion and promoting national cohesion. Greater opportunities shall be provided to marginalized groups of society, particularly girls.
- To achieve the commitments of Government of Pakistan towards Education for All (EFA) and the MDGs, inclusive and child-friendly education shall be promoted.
- Special measures shall be adopted to ensure inclusion of special persons in mainstream education as well as in literacy and Technical and Vocational Education (TVE) programs.
- Governments shall improve provision of quality educational at all levels.
- National Standards for educational inputs, processes and outputs shall be determined. A National Authority for Standards of Education shall be established. The standards shall not debar a provincial and area government/organization from having its own standards higher than the minimum prescribed standards.
- Provincial Governments and district authorities shall establish monitoring and inspection systems to ensure quality education and service delivery in all institutions.
- Steps shall be taken to make provision of education relevant to the employability in market and for promoting innovation in the economy.
- Universities and research institutes shall place greater emphasis on mobilizing research for promoting innovation in the economy. The National Education Policy (2009) NPA to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs, National Plan of Action Pakistan (2013-16).

- Educational inputs need to be designed with comprehension of the challenges and opportunities related to globalization. Strategies shall be developed to optimize opportunities and minimize the potential negative impacts.

2.6.5. Salient Features of Draft National Education Policy, 2017

Following the salient features of the draft National Education Policy;

- Provide free and compulsory education up to Matric in compliance with the provisions of Article 25 (A) of the Constitution
- Meeting the learning needs of the child which include learning tools (literacy, numeracy, problem solving and oral expression) and learning contents (knowledge, skills, value and attitude)
- Honour national and international commitments in education and literacy
- Promote culture of research and innovation
- Increase investment in education to 4% of GDP
- Expand, strengthen and promote universal, comprehensive Early Childhood Education with an objective to ensure holistic development of child to prepare for formal schooling
- Achieve universal quality primary education covering all the three dimensions/ aspects of universalization i.e. universal access/enrolment; universal retention; and universal achievement by 2020
- Expand and strengthen the facilities and services for middle and secondary level education by upgrading more primary schools to middle and secondary level.
- Expand and extend the existing non-formal basic education programme to middle level (VI-VIII)
- Achieve the target of literate Pakistan through launching the country wide campaign of literacy for all and through all
- Re-introduce the quality technical and vocational education stream in selected schools at secondary and higher secondary school level to comply with national TEVTA standards
- Establish trade schools at sub-district and district level
- Encourage, facilitate quality private sector education
- Achieve gender parity, gender equality and empower women and girls within shortest possible time
- Improve the quality of education by introducing reforms of new initiatives in curriculum formulation, textbook and instructional materials development, teacher training, examination and assessment and monitoring and supervision
- Recruit competent, capable and committed scholar-teachers purely on merit basis at all level of education

- Develop and implement National Curriculum Framework and National Standards for each subject from Grade 1-12
- Institutionalize new curriculum formulation, textbook development and review process in the light of 18th Amendment in consultation with National Curriculum Council
- Promote regulated and monitored Public-Private Partnership for educational development
- Improve coordination at local, district, provincial, national and international levels in education and literacy especially to achieve national and international commitments such as SDGs.
- Increase the investment in education by increasing the allocation, simplifying the procedures of releases and expenditure and improving the absorptive capacity of the system.
- Professional finance staff to be hired at the district levels to monitor the effective, timely utilization of funds according to the plans for increasing access upgrading the facilities and hiring of teachers on merit
- Support to Deeni Madaris to utilize their services for promotion of adult literacy and non-formal basic education
- Suggest effective mechanisms for implementation of education policy provisions. Educational administrators at Federal and Provincial levels to be held accountable for failure in timely implementation of policies and plans.

2.7. Focus of All the Policies

The main focus of all these policies was that the government must take steps to allocate enough resources to make sure that Education in the country is;

- **Available:** There must be adequate materials, classrooms, schools, trained teachers to ensure that quality education is available to every child.
- **Accessible:** Schools must be within reach and fit for purpose. They must be affordable for all children. There must be no discrimination for gender, race, religion or any other reason
- **Acceptable:** Education must be of a high quality and include relevant information that is appropriate. Children with disabilities have the right to the same quality of education
- **Adaptable:** Schools and school systems must be suitable for the communities they serve

Chapter-3

SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS OF PRIMARY EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN

3. Endeavors of Provincial Governments after Devolution of Education

After 18th constitutional amendment, education became a provincial subject and almost all of the functions of education have been devolved to Provincial Governments. This amendment holds key implications for the country's system of education. Article, 25A is a commitment and recognition by the state that education is a fundamental right. The Provincial Governments have developed roadmaps to deliver this commitment;

- Punjab School Education Sector Plan, 2013-2017
- Sindh Education Sector Plan, 2014-2018
- Balochistan Education Sector Plan, 2013-2018
- Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Education Sector Plan, 2016-2020

The Plans provide a vision and instruments to implement the legal obligations of Article 25-A for free and compulsory education to all children, and have laid down the foundation for improvement in education sector. The Plans had been envisaged after thorough situational and gap analysis. These Plans very articulately highlight challenges, opportunities, and clear targets to achieve with focus on activities that will expand access to good quality education in a sustainable manner. The accountability mechanisms have also been suggested. The common challenges emerged across Provincial Plans are;

- governance and management issues
- social-economic fabric, demography and variations across districts and areas
- capacity limitations of teachers and infrastructure
- low quality of education,
- absence of course text books
- lack of Resources

The Provincial Education Departments have given operational framework over a period of 5-years to achieve National Target of 25-A, keeping in view the holistic picture. However, despite all these unprecedented efforts, the desired results have not been achieved and the issues are still persisting.

3.1. Primary Education National Scenario³

The projected population⁴ of 5-9+year children in Pakistan is around 23.77 million, wherein male are 52% and female are 48% and net enrolment rate (NER) is 77% for the age group between 5 to 9.

³ Economic Survey of Pakistan 2016-17 and 17-18

- **Classes I-V**

- At the national level, a total of 169.6 thousand primary schools with 475.2 thousand teachers were functional in 2016-17
- An increase of 0.6 percent in primary enrolment was witnessed which increased to 21,686 thousand in 2016-17 against 21,551 thousand in 2015-16
- Primary enrolment is estimated to increase to 22,521 thousand in 2017-18

- **Enrolment Rate**

- a) **Gross Enrolment Rate**

- In 2015-16 GER was recorded at 87 percent as compared to 90 percent in 2013-14, showing a decline of 3 percent

- b) **Net Enrolment Rates**

- Overall NER at the Primary level in 2015-16 recorded at 54 percent as compared to 57 percent in 2013-14 showing a decline of 3 percent.

- **Expenditure on Education**

- Public Expenditure on Education as percentage to GDP is estimated at 2.3 percentage in FY 2016 as compared to 2.2 percentage of GDP in FY 2015
- The education related expenditure recorded at Rs. 663.36 billion in FY 2016 increased by 10.74 percent to Rs. 599.05 billion in FY 2015
- The target is 4.0 percent of GDP by 2018

3.2. Primary Education Provincial Scenario

Following is the situation in Provinces;

- a) **Gross Enrolment Rates**

- Sindh has shown an improvement of 2 percent by achieving primary level GER at 78 percent in 2015-16 against 76 percent in 2013-14
- Punjab declined from 100 percent in 2013-14 to 93 percent in 2015-16
- Balochistan has witnessed a decline of 7 percent from 67 percent in 2013-14 to 60 percent in 2015-16
- Khyber Pakhtunkhwa also registered a slight decline from 89 percent in 2013-14 to 88 percent in 2015-16

⁴ NEMIS Report titled 'Pakistan Education Statistics (2015-16)

b) Net Enrolment Rates

- Sindh remained stable with 48 percent
- Punjab declined from 64 percent to 59 percent
- Khyber Pakhtunkhwa declined from 54 percent to 53 percent
- Balochistan witnessed a significant decline from 39 percent in 2013-14 to 33 percent in 2015-16

3.3. Provincial Annual Development Plans FY 2017

The provincial government are also spending sizeable amount of their Annual Development Plans (ADPs) FY 2017 on education to achieve the target.

- **Punjab**
Punjab government allocated Rs. 67.82 billion against last year Rs. 55.56 billions, an increase of 22.1 percent
- **Sindh**
Sindh government allocated Rs. 20.07 billion compared to Rs. 14.82 billion last year showing an increase of 35.4
- **Khyber Pakhtunkhwa**
Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa allocated Rs. 17.23 billion in FY 2017 as compared to Rs. 16.39 billion in FY 2016 showing an increase of 5.12
- **Balochistan**
Balochistan government allocated Rs. 6.65 billion last year, showing a decline of 34.8 percent

3.4. Data Analysis and Assessment⁵

At the national level, a total of 169.6 thousand primary schools with 475.2 thousand teachers were functional in 2016-17. An increase of 0.6 percent in primary enrolment was witnessed which increased to 21,686 thousand in 2016-17 against 21,551 thousand in 2015-16. Primary enrolment is estimated to increase to 22,521 thousand in 2017-18.

During academic year 2016-17, a total of 49.1 thousand middle schools with 455.4 thousand teachers were functional in the whole country. At national level, an increase of

⁵ Economic Survey of Pakistan, 2017-18

1.1 percent in middle enrolment has been observed as it went up to 6,996 thousand in 2016-17 against 6,922 thousand in 2015-16. Middle enrolment is estimated to have increased by 2.8 percent i.e. from 6,996 thousand to 7,189 thousand in 2017-18.

A total of 31.6 thousand high schools with 560.6 thousand teachers were functional in the country. A decrease of 1.9 percent in high school enrolment has been observed as dropped to 3,583.0 thousand in 2016-17 against 3,652.5 thousand in 2015-16. It is estimated to increase by 5.1 percent i.e. from 3583.1 thousand to 3765.2 thousand in 2017-18

3.4.1. Assessment

The overall education condition is based on key performance indicators such as enrolment rates, number of institutes and teachers which have experienced minor improvement. The total number of enrolments at national level during 2016-17 stood at 48.062 million as compared to 46.223 million during 2015-16. This shows a growth of 3.97 percent and it is estimated to further rise to 50.426 million during 2017-18. The total number of institutes stood at 260.8 thousands during 2016-17 as compared to 252.8 thousands during last year and the number of institutes are estimated to increase to 267.7 thousands during 2017-18. The total number of teachers during 2016-17 was 1.726 million compared to 1.630 million during last year showing an increase of 5.9 percent. This number of teachers is estimated to rise further to 1.808 million during the year 2017-18.

3.4. During the Committee meeting held on 28-06-2018, the Joint Educational Advisor informed that situation of out of school children has reached alarming proportions as according to NIPS Study. In 2016, there were 53.53 million children in age group 5 to 6, out of which 22.85 million are out of school. In 2018, as per population census the total number of children in age group 5 to 16 has risen to 68.4 million, out of which 39.36 million are out of school. He further informed that in 2013, there were 423 schools in Islamabad and now the number is 422.

Chapter-4 GAP ANALYSIS

4. Data Analysis

The data on the template⁶ approved by the Committee based on following indicators (existing and required) received from federation units⁷, and ICT⁸ was analyzed and following gaps were identified in successful implementations of the Plans;

- Infrastructure
- Teachers
- Budget
- Quality Education

4.1 Infrastructure (Existing and Required Schools)

Provinces/areas	2016-17	2021-22	2025-26	2030
Punjab	52231	60066	72079	87936
Sindh	42383	42458	43158	43858
KPK	27524	30072	32871	35949
Balochistan	13674	14881	16311	18322
ICT	411	NIL	NIL	NIL
GB	1284	1362	1444	1532
AJK	6277	6277	6277	6277
FATA	5455	5728	6471	7772

4.2 Teachers (Existing and Required)

Provinces/areas	2016-17	2021-22	2025-26	2030
Punjab	343458	414000	496800	606096
Sindh	150787	183283	233920	298548
KPK	104726	142522	174918	214956
Balochistan	45663	61663	66303	73919
ICT	6500	NIL	NIL	NIL
GB	7363	7813	82933	8804
AJK	28500	28500	28500	28500
FATA	18252	19165	21081	28297

4.3 Budget (Existing and Required)

Provinces/areas	2016-17	2021-22	2025-26	2030
Punjab	18.5 %	NIL	22 %	25 %
Sindh	NIL	NIL	23 %	24 %

⁶ Annex-A

⁷ Annex-B- Punjab, Annex-C- Sindh, Annex-D- KPK, Annex-E-Balochistan, Annex-F-FATA, Annex-G-GB.

⁸ Annex-H.

KPK	119 B	215 B	30 %	32 %
Balochistan	17 %	NIL	22 %	25 %
ICT	7.06 B	11.68 B	19.81 B	32.58 B
GB	20 %	22 %	24 %	26 %
AJK	26 %	28 %	29 %	30 %
FATA	32 %	36 %	41 %	46 %

4.4 Quality Education

Province/areas	Curriculum	Teacher Training Institutions	Assessment Bodies
Punjab	Yes	Yes	Yes
Sindh	Yes	Yes	Yes
KPK	Yes	Yes	Yes
Balochistan	Yes	Yes	Yes
ICT	No	No	No
GB	No	No	No
AJK	Yes	Yes	Yes
FATA	No	Yes	No

4.5. Assessment

During the meetings, the Committee devised a consensus tool for collecting latest data with projected needs in the future to implement the provisions of 25-A from the provincial governments and FATA, GB and AJK regarding infrastructure facilities, quality education, human resources, and budgetary allocations.

4.6. A National Plan is required

The Committee emphasized to develop a consolidated National Plan with ownership both at political and executive level, based on the Provincial and National Plans, Situational & Gap Analysis and Challenges covering the following areas to achieve 25 A in short and long term.

- Year-wise Realistic Targets
- Strategies to Achieve the Targets
- Coordination and Collaboration
- Implementation Framework
- Resources Needed (Human & Financial)
- Output and Outcomes
- Monitoring & Evaluation Mechanism

Chapter-5

KEY LESSONS LEARNT/ CONCLUSION

5. Education is the backbone for national cohesion, inclusive socio-economic development, better standards of living, enhanced productive capacities of individuals, and to make ever increasing population a useful citizenry.

The Committee, after having extensive discussions during meetings⁹ under the leadership of the honorable Wafaqi Mohtasib was of the view that strategic planning is crucial to deal with “Educational Emergency”, keeping in view the lessons from the efforts made in the past and present challenges.

Planning in education sector in Pakistan has been characterized by a lack of consistency, with each successive government formulating a set of educational policies from scratch. The government has been emphasizing on eradication of illiteracy and improving enrollments levels in many of the earlier education policies, but achievements have fallen short, due to several factors such as short of infrastructure, inadequate teachers and human resources and most importantly finances.

There is need to acknowledge the major issue of gap in education coverage, and there is need to have feasible strategy to implement the sustainable programs as project driven activities are not sustainable

Poverty is major obstacle to literacy and education in Pakistan. Given scarce resources, extra care is required to better target the poor population for expanding the scope of incentive schemes and there is a need to identify poverty clusters.

To deal with social-cultural norms there is a need to introduce some incentive schemes for the poor families for sending kids especially girls to primary schools
Parent and community participation is an important ingredient to complement governmental efforts

There should be behavioral change in the society to value education. School is the center of change and Teachers are heart of the system and need more attention and respect.

Effective System-Linkages are essential at all levels are needed to ensure that commitments and policies are only on paper but are actually functional

Commitment is essential at all levels. Hence, national consensus and political support are essential.

⁹ Minutes of these meetings are at Annex-I, J, K, L, M and N

Chapter-6

RECOMMENDATIONS

From the foregoing, the stark gravity of the situation in education sector is evident. Pakistan is faced with the challenge of 25 million children out of school in the age group of 5-16 years and around 2 million children are estimated to be added every year. There are clear constitutional provisions: Article 25-A, Art. 37-B and Art. 38-B, our commitment to the MDG and SDG where our failures are palpable. In the Human Development Index Report of 2017 Pakistan is at the bottom - 147. Clearly, such a grave situation calls for extra-ordinary measures. There has been insufficient commitment and patchy management resulting in low ranking even in the region: vis-a-vis India, Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, etc. Therefore, the following short term and long terms measures are proposed¹⁰;

1. There is an urgent need to declare education emergency and tackle myriad challenges involved including out of school children, quality of education, uniform education system and skill development.
2. Substantial increase in education sector budget is required: from present 2.2% of GDP to 4% of GDP at national level and minimum allocation of 25% total budget of provinces/areas to reach the target in four years. This would entail capacity building at the provincial and district level so that funds can be properly utilized and are not lapsed or allocated to other sectors.
3. A big jump in the construction of new schools in the public sector, recruitment, and training of large number of teachers, furniture, etc. is recommended. Ghost/non functional schools may be made functional. Basic facilities missing in the existing schools will have to be provided on a fast track.
4. As per Pakistan Education Statistics 2016-17, private educational institutions are serving sizeable number of students (36%). While acknowledging the contribution of private schools in imparting education to large number of school going children, the Government should bind private schools to rationalize the fee

¹⁰ These include recommendations made by the Law and Justice Commission and placed at Annex-O

structure and to enroll at least 10% children belonging to poor families under their corporate social responsibility, as it is the responsibility of the state to provide free and compulsory education to all.

5. Under the housing laws, each housing society is under obligation to earmark amenity plots for community service but usually most of these plots are leased out to private elite schools. It is recommended that directions may be issued to the housing societies to give these plots at subsidized rates for the establishment of Government schools.
6. It is also critical that double shifts are introduced in all schools where sufficient number of students are available. However the public schools may also facilitate the non formal schools in the evening. Its implementation would also require additional recruitment of teachers and staff with budget.
7. In many cases, low enrollment is the function of poverty and large families in the lower strata of society. Appropriate incentives will have to be given. Federal govt. and prov. govts. have a number of projects in hand according to special needs with encouraging results. Best practices in community schools, non-formal schools, public private partnership, and voucher scheme can be shared by the provinces and expanded for enhanced targets. A minimum of 50% annual increase in number under these projects is essential to supplement govt's existing effort.
8. The private entrepreneur firms and individuals should be encouraged and given incentives to adopt schools for infrastructure development and provision of necessary facilities. The incentives could be in the shape of tax rebates or attribution of schools to the sponsors.
9. In order to utilize the important sub-sector of education i.e. Deeni Madaris, the Government in consultation with their representatives should devise a programme for imparting formal education.
10. The work of National Commission for Human Development (NCHD) and Basic Education Community School (BECS) for promoting literacy and enrolling out of

school children has been noteworthy in the past. A merit based management with enhanced funding - 50% annually - is recommended to expand the network, to meet the requirement.

11. All these proposals cannot deliver, unless an effective oversight and monitoring mechanism is established. There is no dearth of excellent plans and proposals in the various national education policies since 1947 and provincial/ area development plans. These were prepared with huge sums given to consultants. However, implementation is the weakest link. Consequently, the following oversight and monitoring arrangements is recommended.

- i. Keeping the large number of schools in view, local committee at the district level under the Deputy Commissioner are recommended with heads of education department, regulatory agency, civil society and private sector as members.
- ii. A committee at the provincial level be constituted headed by the Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.) with reps. of education and finance, planning and development, along with private sector schools and head of Prov. Regulatory body, as members.
- iii. The government should in the long run take steps to constitute monitoring committees at Union Council level, having representation of parents, civil society and school administration to act as watch dog.
- iv. School Management Committees may be revitalized and civil society members be involved apart from school administration & parents.

12. The quality of education and standardization of curriculum are important challenges requiring our attention in a well thought-out framework. The Fed. Govt. and Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, along with Prov. Government should undertake immediate review and up-gradation measures. A special think tank can be constituted at the national level comprising experts / professionals and its performance reviewed on a regular basis.

13. In order to prepare the students for gainful employment opportunities, the Government should introduce skill based education having avenues for profitable employment. In this regard NAVTCC, TEVTA and other skill development

institutions may be asked to develop accredited vocational training courses to be imparted to larger members along with formal education - a manifold increase is needed.

14. Since the numbers are so large, and the private sector is already involved on a major scale, the role of regulatory bodies needs to be made more effective by appointing proper persons. Hundreds of thousand parents and students are affected by the mal-practices of private schools and superior courts are approached because the regulatory bodies are unable to enforce and protect the interest of students and parents.
15. Quality education be focussed with special reference to teachers' training. Therefore, emphasis should be given to the improvement of contents of training courses for enhancing teaching skills.
16. In sum, it is imperative that for effective enforcement of Art. 25-A, a paradigm shift is required to accord appropriate priority to this sector in terms of financial and human resources along with sufficiently empowered institutions of oversight.